Virginia Theological Seminary CH 547: History of the Episcopal Church (part 1): The Colonial Era and Early National Period

Instructor: Robert W. Prichard (VTS Faculty member) Fall 2015 Credit Hours: 1.5

Prerequisite(s): Students should have some basic knowledge of American history.

Number of Class sessions per week: one

Course Description:

CH 547 is a one-quarter course on the history of the Episcopal Church (and its Anglican antecedents) in the United States. It covers the period from the beginnings of colonization to 1830. This class is recommended for middlers, seniors, second-year M.A. students, and students in the Anglican Studies program.

The weekly classes will be organized around three elements: 1) a presentation by the professor that focuses on some aspect of historiography of the Episcopal Church—i.e. a discussion of the underlying assumptions of those who have written about the period examined; 2) a discussion of the sections read in *A History of the Episcopal Church*; and 3) individual presentations by students of scholarly articles that they have read for the class. While the three elements will be a part of every class, the order of presentation may change from week to week.

A companion course, CH 548, is taught and covers the period from 1830 to the present.

Learning Outcomes for the course:

At the end of this course, students will be able to recount the basic narrative of Episcopal history up to 1830, with an acquaintance with current scholarship on the subject. (*Religious Heritage, 1.1*). They will also be aware of the role that African Americans, Native Americans, and non-European immigrants have played in that narrative (*Understanding Cultural Contexts 2.2*). In addition they will be able to use their knowledge of historic figures, patterns of leadership, methods of theological articulation, and apologetic strategies to interpret, critique, and transform contemporary use of tradition (*Religious Heritage, 1.2*).

Required Texts: Robert W. Prichard, *A History of the Episcopal Church*, 3rd revised edition (New York: Morehouse Publishing, 2014). In addition articles and passages from recent books, available in the Bishop Payne Library, will illustrate the differing approaches taken by contemporary historians.

Assessment:

Students should 1) participate in the class discussion about the general reading for each week; 2) take responsibility for 5-minute oral presentation on one of the suggested reading assignments (You should assume that the presentations on suggested reading will be weekly, including for the first meeting of the class. The frequency of presentation may be decreased, dependent on class size, however.);

- 3) Submit a two-page book review on one of the articles that they have read for an oral presentation; and 4) write an 8 to 10 page paper.
- The oral presentations on suggested reading should not be attempts to recite everything that you have read. They should focus on the major thrust of the author's presentation, the way that the material has been arranged, and the highlights of the account. If the selection you read is from a longer work, it is often helpful to read the introduction to that work. While you may choose to prepare written notes to

assist you in your presentation, the assignment is oral; you do not need to submit your notes after the presentation.

Sample Oral Presentation

Daniel Boone Birmingham's *Diary of a Pioneer Cleric* (1906) was written at the end of the career of an Episcopal priest who served missions in Kentucky, Arkansas, and Texas. The portion of the work that I read detailed his first ten years in the ordained ministry (1867-77). Birmingham, who had been born in England, raised in New York, and educated at Trinity College, Hartford and The General Theological Seminary, attempted to bring what he understood to be proper liturgical and theological ideas to the people in the missions that he served. His account is peppered with derogatory remarks about the Baptist, Methodist, and Disciples clergy who ministered in the same area ("They had no more education than the horses and mules on which they travelled"; "They had no knowledge at all of the church fathers"; "they thought that bishop was a title that you gave yourself."). One portion of his narrative is illustrative of the general approach that he took in his own parish ministry: He devoted 7 pages of the narrative to his ultimately successful attempted to add a bishop's chair to each building in which he served, and to the opposition to that effort. In contrast, he devoted only a few lines to a major event in the life of the church—the decision in 1873 of Assistant Bishop of Kentucky G D Cummins and others to leave the Episcopal Church and form the Reformed Episcopal Church. For Birmingham, "the decision was no surprise," and was "something that he anticipated from the time of Cummins's first parish visitation. "Cummins had been dismissive of Birmingham's attempt to populate chancels with bishop's chairs.

The book review (which should be on a different topic from the class presentation) should be two, doubled-spaced pages in length. The review should identify the author, a major thrust or argument in the book, the general overall design of the book, the viability of the project, and the book's overall success in meeting its declared goal. See the sample paper below. The paper should be submitted on or before **Thursday, October 8**.

Sample portion of a book review

The Growth of the Colonial Anglican Church is Alythea Truthful's fourth book on English-speaking Protestantism. Although trained at the University of Ely under Reformation historian Culloch McDiarmaid, she has concentrated her writing on the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. A reader in church history at St. Mungo's University in Scotland, she had previously written on the state of the Anglican and Presbyterian Churches in the British Isles. The current book is a new departure; she focuses on the 18th century Anglican Church in the British colonies in Bermuda, the Caribbean, and North America.

As Truthful explains in her introduction, it has been common during the past two centuries to portray 18th-century Anglicanism as a denomination in serious declined. She takes issue with this approach, however, suggesting that it is based more upon biases than upon actual research. Nineteenth and twentieth-century high church and evangelical Episcopalians assumed that any church would have had to been in decline before their arrival on the scene. They also underestimated the result of the American Revolution, which was indeed a major blow to Anglicanism in the United States, but which had a positive benefit on the church in Canada, the Caribbean, and Bermuda. As Truthful explains, they assumed that the weakened church that they knew was the result of a century long decline, rather than an outgrowth of a specific period of warfare.

Truthful bases her alternative interpretation upon a close reading of letters to the Secretary of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts and upon correspondence of the Bishop of London from the years before 1775. She finds those letters to be filled with optimism and hope. Accounts of full churches, active parishioners, and outreach efforts are common.

Chapter 6, which is devoted to church architecture, draws on works of architectural historians to suggest that the transformation in church designs away from preaching house to deeper chancels and more central altars was not, as is often claimed, the result of Oxford Movement innovations, but was an outgrowth of an 18th century church construction program that began in England and spread to the colonies.

Truthful's account provides a useful corrective to a long tradition of scholarship on the 18th century. It certainly will spur additional research on the century

The longer paper (which should be on a different topic than the class presentation or book review) should focus on a moment of transition: the abandonment of a familiar pattern, the initiation of a new program, the dissemination of a new idea, the resolutions of an old dispute, the creation of a new institution, a shift in attitudes of an important individual, etc. It should be based upon both a primary document (i.e. one created by those who were direct participants in or contemporary observers of the transition described) and at least two secondary works (written by those who were not themselves participants in the events described.) The paper should have a clear focus. A topic such as the response of the Anglican clergy in Boston to George Whitefield's preaching of rebirth, as illustrated by the letters to the SPG office in England, would be appropriate. Topics such as "George Whitefield," "the Great Awakening," or "the Episcopal Church in Massachusetts" would be far too broad.

Students should take care to match the topic and premise of the paper with the available evidence. Everything is evidence for something, but sometimes a source—particularly a secondary work or a closely edited collection of primary materials—tells more about the attitudes and ideas of the author and his or her generation than about the original events. An early 20^{th} century account about the contentment of African Americans under slavery is a better source for the ideas, attitudes, and myths of early 20^{th} century white Southerners, for example, than it is for pre-Civil War conditions of slavery. That does not mean, however, that one could not use such works as the basis for a paper; it is permissible to write about the way in which people shaped their historical accounts at a particular point in time.

The paper should demonstrate a general awareness of the issues of interpretation discussed in the weekly classes. A student who wrote about the progress of the Episcopal Church in 1720 should, for example, be aware that some authors see that general period as one of health and growth in the colonial Anglican Church, while others see it as a period of decline and weakness. The paper should also demonstrate some awareness of those who have written on your specific topic before you. Are your agreeing with their interpretations? Looking for a way to reconcile two competing interpretations? Providing a narrative of events that major interpreters have overlooked? (In this last case you will need to provide some evidence that you have looked at appropriate sources and been unable to find any information about your topic.)

Papers should be typed or legibly written, and they should be clear in style, with a minimum of grammatical or spelling errors. Students should respect the page limit and not use the creative capabilities of word processors to double or halve the normal number of words per page.

The paper is due on or before **Thursday**, **October 15**. The course grade is based on the paper (60%), the book review (25%), and class participation (15%).

Reserve Reading

Because of the small size of the class, most of the individual class reading will not be placed on reserve in Bishop Payne Library. Below you will find, however, resources, which may be useful in student papers and book reviews. Among these materials are two recent histories of the Episcopal Church: David L. Holmes, *A Brief History of the Episcopal Church* (Valley Forge, Penn.: Trinity Press International, 1993) and David Hein and Gardiner H. Shattuck, Jr., *The Episcopalians* (Westport, Ct.: Praeger, 2004).

Call number	Author(s)	Title
BX5880.D637.1994	Armentrout&	Documents of Witness
	Slocum	
BX5917.V8 B66 2007	Bond & Gundersen	Episcopal Church in Virginia
BX5918.P4T45 2012	Contosta	This Far by Faith
BX5610.H417.2004	Hayes	Anglicans in Canada
BX5930.3.H468.2004	Hein & Shattuck	The Episcopalians

BX5005 .H443 2010	Hebb	Samuel Seabury and Charles Inglis
BX5880.H749 1993	Holmes	A Brief History of the Episcopal Church
BX5979. L675 1996	Lewis	With a Steady Beat
BX5881. L898	Loveland	Critical Years
BX5995.S3 M37 2004	Marshall	One Catholic, and Apostolic: Samuel Seabury
BX5917.V8.N3999 2002	Nelson	A Blessed Company
BX5880.P947	Prichard	A History of the Episcopal Church
BX5880.R287 1986	Prichard	Readings from the History of the Epis. Ch.
BX5917.V8 W56 2010	Winner	A Cheerful & Comfortable Faith
BX5881.W916	Woolverton	Colonial Anglicanism

Class Schedule:

#1 [Note: please do the reading prior to the meeting of the first class]

The Founding of the Church in an Age of Fragmentation (1585-1688)

General Reading: History of the Episcopal Church, chapter 1. (To be read by all)

Articles for discussion (Select a single article or portion of a book from among the various categories—one item rather than a whole category—and be prepared to give an informal sevenminute presentation about it in class):

- Diocesan history: Edward L. Bond and Joan R. Gundersen, "the Episcopal Church in Virginia, 1607-2007," *Virginia Magazine of History and Biography* 115 (2007): 165-181 [hardback: 5-21].
- Institutional history: Borden W. Painter, "The Anglican Vestry in Colonial America," (Ph.D. diss., Yale University, 1965), 56-70; "Introduction"; John K. Nelson, *A Blessed Company* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 13-84; Brydon, *Virginia's Mother Church*, 1:30-49, 117-41, 172-98; Jewel L. Spangler, *Virginia Reborn: Anglican Monopoly, Evangelical dissent, and the rise of the Baptist in the Late Eighteenth Century* (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2008), 9-42 [This chapter is a good overview of the Anglican establishment in the 17th and 18th century, with references to the laws of establishment in the 17th century].
- Theology. John Woolverton, *Colonial Anglicanism* (Detroit: Wayne State Press, 1984), 37-55; Perry Miller, "Religion and Society in the Early Literature of Virginia" in *Errand into the Wilderness* (New York: Harper & Row, Harper Torchbooks, 1956), 99-140; John Butler, *Awash in the Sea of Faith: Christianizing the American People* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1990), 7-66; Edward L. Bond, *Damned Souls in Tobacco Company: Religion in Seventeenth-century Virginia* (Macon, George: Mercer University Press, 2000), 37-92.
- Social History. Rebecca Anne Goetz, *The Baptism of Early Virginia: How Christianity Created Race* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2012), 61-85; Edward B. Rugemer, "The Development of Mastery and Race in Comprehensive Slaves Codes of the Greater Caribbean during the Seventeenth Century," William and Mary Quarterly 70 (July 2013); David Hackett Fischer, *Albion's Seed: Four British Folkways in America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1989), 232-46, 274-86, 321-40; April Lee Hatfield, *Atlantic Virginia: Intercolonial Relations in the Seventeenth Century* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004), 110-36.Philip D. Morgan, *Slave Counter Point: Black Culture in the Eighteenth-Century Chesapeake and Lowcountry* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press for the Omohundro Institute, 1998), 1-23; Morgan Godwyn, "The Negro's and Indians Advocate" in *Readings from the History of the Episcopal Church*, 3-21; Lewis, *Steady Beat*, 17-24.

#2 The Age of Reason in the American Colonies (1688-1740) General Reading: *History*, chapter 2; and Articles (Select One):

- Diocesan history: Bond and Gundersen, "the Episcopal Church in Virginia," 181-90 [hardback: 21-29]; *This Far by Faith, Tradition and Change in the Episcopal Diocese of Pennsylvania*, ed. David R. Contosta (University Park: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 2012), 7-26.
- Church Membership and class status: Bruce Steiner, "New England Anglicanism: A Genteel Faith?" *William and Mary Quarterly* 27 (January 1970): 122-35; Bond and Gundersen, "Colonial Origins," 181-90.
- Missions. John Butler, *Awash in the Sea of Faith: Christianizing the American People* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1990), 98-128; Owannah Anderson, *400 Years* (Cincinnati: Forward Movement, 1997), 1-43; Rowan Strong, *Anglicanism and the British empire, c. 1700-1800* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007),1-117.
- Theology. Thomas Bray, "Catechetical Lectures" in *Readings from the History of the Episcopal Church*, 24-40; Patrick Henry Butler, III, "Knowing the Uncertainties of this Life" (Ph.D. diss.: Johns Hopkins University, 1998), 10-37, 501-23; Bond, *Damn Souls*, 239-85.
- Social History: Alan Gallay, *The Indian Slave Trade: the rise of the English Empire in the American South, 1670-1717* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2002), 223-40; William A. Pettigrew, Freedom's Debt: *The Royal African Company and the Politics of the Atlantic Slave Trade, 1672-1752* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, 2013), chapter 3:Patricia U. Bonomi, *Under the Cope of Heaven: Religion, Society, and Politics in Colonial America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986), 39-61; Darrett B & Anita H Rutman, *A Place in Time* (New York: W.W. Norton and Co., 1984), 94-127; John K. Nelson, *A Blessed Company*, 239-81; Anne Sorrell Dent, "God and Gentry: Public and Private Religion in Tidewater Virginia, 1607-1800" (Ph. D. diss., University of Kentucky, 2001), 176-216, 267-313; Anthony S. Parent, Jr., *Foul Means: The Formation of a Slave Society in Virginia, 1660-1740* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, 2003), 236-64; Lauren F.Winner, *A Cheerful and Comfortable Faith* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010), 26-59.
- Institutional History: Painter, "The Anglican Vestry,"

#3 The Great Awakening (1740-1776) General Reading: *History*, Chapter 3. Articles (select One)

- Dioceses: Bond and Gundersen, "the Episcopal Church in Virginia," 190-92 (magazine version) or 29-32 (hardback); *This Far by Faith*, ed. Contosta, 26-35.
- Revivalism. Harry S. Stout, *The Divine Dramatist: George Whitefield and the Rise of Modern Evangelicalism* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1991), 87-112; Christine Leigh Heyrman, *Southern Cross: the Beginnings of the Bible Belt* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1997), 3-27; Harry S. Stout, *The Divine Dramatist: George Whitefield and the Rise of Modern Evangelicalism* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1991), 113-32; Anne Sorrell Dent, "God and Gentry," 319-51; Robert C. Monk, "Unity and Diversity among 18th Century Colonial Anglicans and Methodists," *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church* 38 (March 1969): 51-69
- Theology. Devereux Jarratt, "The Miserable State of Man" in *Readings from the History of the Episcopal Church*, 41-53; Martha Laurens Ramsay, "Religious Exercises" in *Readings from the History of the Episcopal Church*, 54-57 and *Freedom is a Dream*, ed. Sheryl A. Kujawa-Holbrook (New York: Church Publishing, 2002), 1-5; and William Douglas, "Sermons" [This is a publication currently in progress, speak with Professor Prichard about access to this material].

• Biography. David L. Holmes, ed., *The Life of the Reverend Devereux Jarratt* (Cleveland: Pilgrim Press, 1995), 1-46.

#4 The American Revolution (1776-1800) General Reading: *History*, chapter 4. Articles (Select One)

- The pre-war tensions: Richard Pointer, *Protestant Pluralism and the New York Experience* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1988), 53-71; Peter M. Doll, *Revolution, Religion and National Identity* (Madison: Farleigh Dickinson University Press, 2000), 155-209.
- Loyalists and Patriots. Butler, *Awash in the Sea of Faith*, 194-224; Bond and Gundersen, "the Episcopal Church in Virginia," 201-220 [hardback: 41-60]; Nancy L. Rhoden, *Revolutionary Anglicanism: The Colonial Church of England Clergy during the American Revolution* (New York: New York University Press, 1999), 116-43; *This Far by Faith*, ed. Contosta, 44-82; Richard Pointer, *Protestant Pluralism*, 75-102; and Alan L. Hayes, *Anglicans in Canada: Controversies and Identity in Historical Perspective* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2004), 50-61, 82-84, 207-11, 225-36; *This Far by Faith*, ed. Contosta, 35-39.
- African American history: Christopher Leslie Brown, *Moral Capital: Foundations of British Abolitionism* (chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press for the Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture, 2006), 209-58; Lamin Sanneh, *Abolitionists Abroad: American Blacks and the Making of Modern West Africa* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999), 22-65.
- Institutional History: Ecclesiology: William White, "Case of the Episcopal Churches" in *Readings* from the History of the Episcopal Church; Frederick Mills, Bishop by Ballot (New York: Oxford, 1978), 288-307; Clara O. Loveland, The Critical Years: The Reconstruction of the Anglican Church in the United States of America: 1780-89 (Greenwich, Conn.: The Seabury Press, 1956), 236-72; Holmes, ed., The Life of Jarratt, 61-78.
- Liturgy. Marion Hatchett, The Making of the First American Book of Common Prayer (New York: Seabury, 1983), 107-130; Paul V. Marshall, One Catholic, and Apostolic: Samuel Seabury and the Early Episcopal Church (New York: Church Publishing, 2004), 181-206, 236-63; and Ross N. Hebb, Samuel Seabury and Charles Inglis: Two Bishops, Two Churches (Madison: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 2004), 61-82.
- Social History: John K. Nelson, *A Blessed Company* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina press, 2002), 282-302.
- #5 Rational Orthodoxy (1800-1840) **Note: Last Day on which Book Review may be submitted.** General Reading: Prichard, *History*, chapter 5.

Articles (Choose One)

- Bond and Gundersen, "the Episcopal Church in Virginia," 220-34 (magazine version) or 60-74 (hardback).
- Ian T. Douglas, Fling out the Banner (New York: Church Hymnal, 1996), 15-48
- Missions.; David L. Holmes, "The Domestic Missionary Movements in the Episcopal Church in the Nineteenth Century" in Charles R. Henery, ed., *Beyond the Horizon* (Cincinnati: Forward Movement, 1986), 16-35.
- Education: John Booty, *Mission and Ministry: A History of the Virginia Theological Seminary* (Harrisburg, Morehouse, 1995), 25-56: John Page Williams, *A History of Church Schools in the Diocese of Virginia*, ed. Robert W. Prichard (Harrisburg: Morehouse Publishing for Church School in the Diocese of Virginia, 1999), 195-210.
- Social History: Richard Rankin, Ambivalent Churchman and Evangelical Churchwomen: The

Religion of the Episcopal Elite in North Carolina, 1800-1860 (Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 1993), 124-68; E. Brooks Holifield, The Gentlemen Theologians: American Christianity in Southern Culture, 1795-1860 (Durham: Duke, 1978), 5-23; Craig D. Townsend, Faith in their own Color; Black Episcopalians in antebellum New York City (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005), 108-39.

#6 Hobartian Theology.

General Reading: Prichard, History, chapter 6.

Articles (Choose One):

- Historical Accounts: Robert Bruce Mullin, *Episcopal Vision/American Reality* (New Haven: Yale Press, 1986), 60-96; E. Clowes Chorley, *Men and movements in the American Episcopal Church* (New York, Scribner, 1946), 133-93; Morgan Dix *et. al.*, *History of the Parish of Trinity Church in the City of New York*, 7 vols. (New York, G.P. Putnam's sons, 1898-) 3:60-82, 105-58.
- High Church preaching: John Henry Hobart, "On the State of the Departed" and William R. Whittingham, "Defense" in *Readings from the History of the Episcopal Church*, 90-99; George T. Chapman, Sermons to Presbyterians of all sects: supplementary to Sermons upon the ministry, worship and doctrine (Hartford, Conn.: F.J. Huntington, 1836). 15-45.
- Roman Catholicism: Ellin Kelly and Annabelle Melville eds., *Elizabeth Seton: Selected Writings* (New York: Paulist Press, , 1987), 141-174; John Henry Hopkins, *The primitive creed, examined and explained; in two parts. The first part containing sixteen discourses on the Apostles' creed; designed for popular use. The second part containing a dissertation on the testimony of the early councils, and the fathers, from the apostolic age to the end of the fourth century, with observations on certain theological errors of the present day* (Burlington, E. Smith, 1834), 1-34.
- Education: Powel Mills Dawley, *The Story of the General Theological Seminary, a Sequicentennial History, 1817-1967* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1969), 111-44; Robert W. Prichard, *The Nature of Salvation* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1997), 7-35.